Making higher education markets

16 November 2016
Dr Janja Komljenovic, Lancaster University
Outline

• Studying higher education markets
• Theoretical and analytical approaches
• Methodology and empirical work
• Two instantiations of higher education markets
• Emerging higher education industry?
Studying higher education markets (marketization, commodification, privatization)

- Four main groups of literature in relation to markets in higher education
  - Higher education policy and governance reforms
    - International – national – institutional
    - Robertson, van der Wende, Westerheijden – Ball, de Boer, Dill, Jongbloed, Middlehurst, Teixeira – Ball, Deem, Neave, Shore, Wright,...
  - Presence of (quasi)markets in higher education
    - Brown, Dill, Jongbloed, Marginson,...
  - Privatisation and commodification of higher education
    - Ball, Leslie, Levy, Middlehurst, Naidoo, Slaughter, Youdell,..
  - Consequences of marketization in higher education
    - Barnett, Connell, Dos Santos, Henkel, Ivancheva, Lynch, Naidoo, Noble,..
Studying higher education markets

• Important insights, but also...
  – Focus on macro and meso – as if the micro has happened or will happen
  – Focus on discourse and policy – more empirical work needed
  – Static and technical views of the markets (market as ‘free’, simple, one, disembedded from society) – not scrutinising markets in their own right
  – Focusing on ‘the university’ and only on study provision and to some extent research outputs
Theoretical and analytical approaches

• What are markets
  – Departing understandings from economic theory
  – Markets as arenas of social interaction with specific elements, but *social* (Aspers, Beckert, Berndt, Boeckler, Callon, Fligstein, Granovetter, Peck, Swedberg...)
    • Instituted and embedded
    • Variegation, differentiation
    • Social and political
    • Processual account
  – Work to be done to imagine, construct and maintain markets:
    • Market framings (Çalışkan and Callon)
    • Market ordering (Beckert, Aspers)
    • Institutions, devices, cognitive framings
DIMENSIONS of market-making

- MACRO-MESO: Societal transformation
- MICRO: Investments to make market work

THE WHAT of market-making

- MARKET FRAMINGS:
  1. Pacifying goods / creating commodities
  2. Marketizing agencies
  3. Marketizing encounters

THE HOW of market-making

- Social institutions and devices
- Market ordering
- Mental representations of future states
Methodology and empirical work

• Methodology: Intensive research design; Exploratory research
• Method: Semi-structured interviews, document analysis, observation
• Analysis: Content analysis and thick description
• Today focusing on two instantiations of making markets:
  – **ICEF GmbH**: ICEF documents, ICEF provided data, observation and notes from two events, 4 interviews, web pages and news
  – **LinkedIn Corporation**: Company annual reports from 2011 to 2014, LinkedIn press releases and information about their products, news, webpages, interviews from the 2 UK universities (26 interviews, 30 annual reports and financial statements, 5 strategic documents, HESA statistical data, web pages)
  – (Altogether: series of cases & 94 interviews, observation of 4 events (field notes), institutional strategic and financial documents, web pages, news, statistical data)
Mapping market exchanges concerning the two universities

- University as a seller
  - Axis X
  - University as a buyer

- OUT and FOR-PROFIT
- OUT and NOT-FOR-PROFIT
- IN and FOR-PROFIT
- IN and NOT-FOR-PROFIT

Transactions for making profits

Axis Y

Transactions without making profits
Brokering market relations into the higher education sector: Case of ICEF GmbH

Source: https://www.icef.com/
ICEF North America welcomes many first-timers

Over 1,000 agents, exhibitors, speakers and US and Canadian educators attended ICEF’s North America workshop in Miami this month, making the three-day event the largest of its kind in North America. This record attendance is concurrent with an ongoing shift in the student recruitment landscape in the US, following a historic ruling by NACAC allowing its members to pay commission to education agencies.

Source: The Pie News
Prices for attending ICEF workshops for education institutions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Single event booking</th>
<th>Workshops</th>
<th>Roadshows</th>
<th>Agent Focus</th>
<th>HE Partnership Forum</th>
<th>Australia/New Zealand Workshop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First participant early rate</td>
<td>€3,900</td>
<td>€4,300</td>
<td>€2,925</td>
<td></td>
<td>AU$ 5,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First participant regular rate</td>
<td>€4,400</td>
<td>€4,900</td>
<td>€3,300</td>
<td>€495</td>
<td>AU$ 6,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second participant</td>
<td>€2,400</td>
<td>€2,400</td>
<td>€1,800</td>
<td>€495</td>
<td>AU$ 3,400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ICEF offers discounts to institutions attending multiple workshops: 2 Workshops – 18%; 3 Workshops – 20%; 4 Workshops – 23%; 5 Workshops – 25%; 6 Workshops – 27%.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of workshop</th>
<th>Global workshops</th>
<th>Regional workshops</th>
<th>Destination workshops</th>
<th>Agent roadshows</th>
<th>Agent focus</th>
<th>Higher education to higher education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attendees</td>
<td>For educators and agents from all over the world (exhibition is part of the event)</td>
<td>For educators from all over the world; and agents from specific countries and regions (exhibition is part of the event)</td>
<td>For educators from either North America or Australia/New Zealand; and agents focused on these study destinations (exhibition is part of the event)</td>
<td>For educators from all over the world; and selected agents from key markets</td>
<td>For educators from all over the world; and student recruitment agents from Turkey</td>
<td>For higher education educators from all over the world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locations in 2016</td>
<td>2 events: Higher Education in the UK (around the EAIE annual conference); Berlin (oldest and biggest)</td>
<td>4 events: Dubai, Russia, Brazil, China</td>
<td>3 events: Australia and New Zealand (Australia); North America (Canada); North America (USA)</td>
<td>3 events: Japan-Korea; Mexico-Colombia; Thailand-Vietnam</td>
<td>1 event: Turkey</td>
<td>1 event: UK (organised around the EAIE conference)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ICEF (2015c).
ICEF at the crossroad of two markets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Market</th>
<th>Commodity</th>
<th>Buyers</th>
<th>Sellers</th>
<th>ICEF role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher education market</td>
<td>Service of student experience and qualification at the end</td>
<td>International students</td>
<td>Universities</td>
<td>Promoting and being present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment agents market</td>
<td>Service of student recruitment / student placement</td>
<td>Universities</td>
<td>Recruitment agents</td>
<td>Market ordering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matching market</td>
<td>Meetings between universities and agents</td>
<td>Universities</td>
<td>Providers of encounters*</td>
<td>Selling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: *These are private companies, chief among them being: Alphe from the UK, BMI from Brazil, FPP EduMedia from Brazil, ICEF from Germany, and Weba from Switzerland.
ICEF as a broker between markets
Social media platforms ordering markets and extracting value: Case of LinkedIn Corporation

Source: LinkedIn platform
## Free Solutions

### Stay Connected & Informed

- **LinkedIn Flagship:** Feed, Me, Messaging, My Network & Search, People You May Know, Pulse, Influencers, Groups, Slideshare, LinkedIn Lookup, Address Book Importer, Publishing Platform

### Advance My Career

- Jobs
- Job Search App
- Company Pages
- University Pages
- Who's Viewed Your Profile / How You Rank
- Rich Media / Skills / Endorsements

### Ubiquitous Access

- LinkedIn Mobile
- Robust set of APIs

## Monetized Solutions

### Talent Solutions

- Hiring
  - LinkedIn Corporate Solutions
  - (Recruiter, Referrals, Job Slots, Recruitment Media, Career Pages)
  - LinkedIn Job Postings
  - Job Seeker
  - Recruiter Lite
  - *Learning & Development*
  - *Lynda.com*

### Marketing Solutions

- Sponsored Updates
- LinkedIn Ads
- Elevate
- Sponsored InMails
- Display Ads
- Ads API

### Premium Subscriptions

- Professional/Individual Subscriptions
- Sales Solutions (Sales Navigator)
- Profinder
LinkedIn Corporation - growth of income streams from 2011 onwards (in US $, in millions)

Source: Figure prepared by the author, based on the data from LinkedIn’s annual reports (LinkedIn Corporation, 2012, 2013a, 2014b, 2015c, 2016).
LinkedIn works FOR and IN higher education

LinkedIn’s services and products developed for students and universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Looking for universities: university rankings, field of study explorer, university finder</td>
<td>- Student profiles: your students can showcase their experience, courses, projects in order to be discovered in recruiter searches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Personal decision board</td>
<td>- Alumni tracking: discover paths and contact information of your alumni, find good examples of alumni to show to students or for promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Choosing universities based on career outcomes</td>
<td>- Groups: use groups for discussions and communications with alumni and students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Building your professional brand (author’s note: meaning personal profile)</td>
<td>- University pages: to brand and promote yourself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Building a student profile</td>
<td>- Students jobs pages: motivate your students for work experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tailoring your profile to your goals</td>
<td>- Use advanced search for people and contacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Finding a student job or internship</td>
<td>- Use LinkedIn user profiles in student recruitment processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Networking on LinkedIn</td>
<td>- Key products to be: alumni tool, students jobs portal, student profiles, university pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- LinkedIn for Students: educating students for creating best LinkedIn profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

They’ve [LinkedIn] created a new way of slicing their data, that’s particular to higher education, they’re starting to create posts [jobs] who are coming out to talk to universities, to career offices, alumni offices, to tell us about all the features that can be used. They are starting dialogues with us what other software we would like. They haven’t asked us to pay for anything yet, but it’s absolutely coming. (Interview I1_2).
## Uses of LinkedIn by two case universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Promotion and Branding</th>
<th>Communication</th>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Cooperation and work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University pages</td>
<td>Alumni group</td>
<td>Extract data from LinkedIn into university database</td>
<td>Networking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University search</td>
<td>Students career group</td>
<td></td>
<td>Looking for people and companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University ranking</td>
<td>Other groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Opportunity to order and expand HE markets
  – New dimensions of market-making (university pages, university search, marketing, showcasing students, staff and alumni,...)
  – New temporalities and spatialities into university’s awareness of its brand
  – New realities and risks for universities [quote]
  – New forms of competition in terms of scale and scope
  – Governance: algorithms – structuring new forms of valuation of higher education
Whereas employers and job seekers generally rely on formal education degrees and job titles to determine fit for a role—and national and international statistics agencies similarly capture a country’s human capital endowment in this way—the LinkedIn data reveals that understanding an economy’s human capital base at the actual skills level is crucial because formal qualifications alone are often insufficiently meaningful and job titles may imply very different skills requirements in different industries and geographies. Therefore, skills are a foundational block in formulating future workforce and human capital strategies. (World Economic Forum, 2016, p. 18).
- Privatisation of education governance
- Privatisation of education competition
- Privatisation of education provision

LinkedIn is painting a scenario in which you search for a job, see the skills required for that job, and then are directed to a course from Lynda.com that will train you in those skills. Alternatively, a recruiter could search for available candidates based on the courses they’ve taken. You can already add courses to your profile, but courses endorsed by LinkedIn may carry more clout. (Wagner, 2015).
Big data

The Economic Graph

Members 350M+
companies 4M+
jobs 3M+
schools 25K+
knowledge 17M+ presentations
skills 1M+ long-form posts

Other cases and outputs

- 3 British Universities
- PPPs: Into University Partnerships Ltd
- NAFSA Annual Conference and Expo
- EAIE Annual Conference and Exhibition

- ...
Concluding

• Epistemic gains of approaches to studying markets
• Markets in this emerging industry are diverse, variegated, processual and relational

AND

• Taking higher education as a sector
• Diversity of actors, processes, scales, practices, institutions, ...
• Micro-macro
Thank you

Contact: j.komljenovic@lancaster.ac.uk

This work was supported by the European Commission FP7 People programme, under Marie Curie Initial Training Network UNIKE (Universities in Knowledge Economies) Grant Agreement no.: 317452